

JANUARY 2013 ■ VOLUME 107, NUMBER 1

# American Journal of International Law

## INSIDE THIS ISSUE

■ International Criminal Law  
by Other Means: The  
Quasi-criminal  
Jurisdiction of the  
Human Rights Courts  
Alexandra Huneus

■ Clash of Paradigms:  
Actors and Analogies  
Shaping the Investment  
Treaty System  
Anthea Roberts

■ Agora: The South China Sea  
Zhiguo Gao and Bing Bing Ji  
Florian Dupuy and Pierre-Marie Dupuy  
Robert Beckman



PUBLISHED BY The American Society of International Law

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW



VOL. 107

January 2013

NO. 1

CONTENTS

PAGE

- International Criminal Law by Other Means: The Quasi-criminal Jurisdiction of the Human Rights Courts** *Alexandra Huneus* 1

Although the regional human rights courts have no criminal jurisdiction and cannot find individual responsibility, the Inter-American Court of Human Rights regularly orders states to investigate and punish gross human rights violations, and monitors the progress of the resulting prosecutions. Today, it is monitoring the progress of fifty-one prosecutions across fifteen states for acts that amount to international crimes. The article explores the evolution of such quasi-criminal jurisdiction in the regional rights courts, and juxtaposes this development to the work of the international criminal tribunals.

- Clash of Paradigms: Actors and Analogies Shaping the Investment Treaty System** *Anthea Roberts* 45

When seeking to understand the nature of the investment treaty system, participants routinely draw analogies from and with public international law, international commercial arbitration, public law, trade law, and human rights law. However, these analogies frequently point to distinct (and sometimes clashing) conclusions as a result of differences in their underlying paradigms. This article examines what each paradigm reveals and obscures about the investment treaty system and how the backgrounds and interests of different actors inform their choice of analogies.

- Agora: The South China Sea**  
Editors' Introduction *Lori Fisler Damrosch and Bernard H. Oxman* 95

- The Nine-Dash Line in the South China Sea: History, Status, and Implications  
*Zhiguo Gao and Bing Bing Jia* 98

- A Legal Analysis of China's Historic Rights Claim in the South China Sea  
*Florian Dupuy and Pierre-Marie Dupuy* 124

- The UN Convention on the Law of the Sea and the Maritime Disputes in the South China Sea  
*Robert Beckman* 142

## Current Developments

- The Expulsion of Aliens and Other Topics: The Sixty-Fourth Session of the International Law Commission *Sean D. Murphy* 164

## International Decisions

*Edited by David P. Stewart*

- Ahmadou Sadio Diallo* (Mads Andenas) 178

International Court of Justice judgment on compensation for arrest, detention, and expulsion of Guinean citizen by Democratic Republic of the Congo

- Air Transport Association of America v. Secretary of State for Energy and Climate Change* (Glen Plant) 183

European Court of Justice judgment on compatibility of EU emissions trading scheme with treaty commitments and customary international law

<i>United States—Measures Concerning the Importation, Marketing and Sale of Tuna and Tuna Products</i> (Gregory Shaffer)	192
World Trade Organization Appellate Body decision on compliance of U.S. dolphin-safe labeling requirements with the Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade	
<i>Unconstitutionality of Article 57, Section II, Paragraph a) of the Code of Military Justice and Legitimation of the Injured Party and His Family to Present an Appeal for the Protection of Constitutional Rights</i> (Christina M. Cerna)	199
Mexican Supreme Court ruling on application of human rights principles to the Mexican Code of Military Justice	

## Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International Law

*Edited by John R. Crook*

U.S. Department of State Legal Adviser Surveys U.S. International Lawmaking Practice	208
United States Comments on International Law Commission's Current Projects	214
Nevada Supreme Court Directs Hearing to Assess Possible Prejudice to Foreign National from Failure of Consular Notification in Capital Case	216
Tenth Circuit Affirms Rwanda's President's Head-of-State Immunity	218
Second Circuit Rejects Sovereign Immunity Claim, Upholds Discovery Against Argentina's Banks	219
Second Circuit Affirms Injunction Requiring Argentina to Pay on Defaulted Bonds, Rejects Immunity Arguments	221
UN General Assembly Grants Palestine Status as Nonmember Observer State; United States Votes No	224
United States, Canada Conclude Revised Great Lakes Water Quality Agreement	225
U.S. Department of Justice and Securities and Exchange Commission Issue Guide to Foreign Corrupt Practices Act Enforcement	227
Securities and Exchange Commission Adopts Rules Requiring Disclosure of Foreign Payments by Resource Companies	228
U.S. Department of State Fact Sheet Summarizes U.S. Sanctions on Iran	230
D.C. Circuit Reverses Hamdan Conviction; Law of War Does Not Include "Material Support for Terrorism"	234
United States Criticizes ASEAN Human Rights Declaration	237
United States Reelected to Human Rights Council	239
United States Wins Long-Running Extradition Case; Other Requests Unsuccessful	241
State Department Legal Adviser Addresses International Law in Cyberspace	243
Brief Notes	248

## Recent Books on International Law

*Edited by Richard B. Bilder*

### Book Reviews

Scheffer, David. <i>All the Missing Souls: A Personal History of the War Crimes Tribunals</i> (Doug Cassel)	252
Riddell, Anna, and Brendan Plant. <i>Evidence Before the International Court of Justice</i> (John R. Crook)	259
Cheng, Tai-Heng. <i>When International Law Works: Realistic Idealism After 9/11 and the Global Recession</i> (John F. Murphy)	265
Sivakumaran, Sandesh. <i>The Law of Non-international Armed Conflict</i> (Yoram Dinstein)	270
Finkelstein, Claire, Jens David Ohlin, and Andrew Altman (eds.). <i>Targeted Killings: Law and Morality in an Asymmetrical World</i> (Steven R. Ratner)	274
Witt, John Fabian. <i>Lincoln's Code: The Laws of War in American History</i> (Gary D. Solis)	279
Bodansky, Daniel. <i>The Art and Craft of International Environmental Law</i> (David Freestone)	284

### Books Received

<b>International Legal Materials.</b> Contents, Vol. LI, Nos. 4, 5	292
--	-----



# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

VOL. 107

April 2013

NO. 2

CONTENTS

PAGE

<b>Sovereigns as Trustees of Humanity: On the Accountability of States to Foreign Stakeholders</b>	<i>Eyal Benvenisti</i>	295
<p>The concept of sovereignty crystallized in an era when distances were large, and self-sufficiency the aspiration. This view of sovereignty is no longer sustainable and yields inequitable, undemocratic consequences. This article argues that in a densely populated and deeply integrated world, sovereignty should be understood as also involving a trusteeship toward humanity at large. Sovereigns should be required to take into account other-regarding considerations when forming national policies that may have effects beyond their national jurisdictions, even absent specific treaty obligations.</p>		
<b>Crimes Against Humanity in the Modern Age</b>	<i>Leila Nadya Sadat</i>	334
<p>This article analyzes the centrality of crimes against humanity prosecutions to the International Criminal Court's fulfillment of its mandate to prevent and punish atrocities committed in strife-torn regions. Ad hoc international criminal tribunals established in several states will complete their work soon, leaving the Court as the sole functioning international criminal authority. But the Court's jurisprudence since its 1998 founding raises serious concerns about its interpretation of, and willingness to fully utilize, the powers conferred by its jurisdictional statute.</p>		
<b>Notes and Comments</b>		
Editors' Note	<i>Lori Fisler Damrosch and Bernard H. Oxman</i>	378
Law, Power, and Principles	<i>Michael J. Glennon</i>	378
Dangerous Departures	<i>Mary Ellen O'Connell</i>	380
No Thank You to a Radical Rewrite of the <i>Jus ad Bellum</i>	<i>Gabor Rona and Raha Wala</i>	386
Self-Defense Against Nonstate Actors: Reflections on the "Bethlehem Principles"	<i>Elizabeth Wilmshurst and Michael Wood</i>	390
<b>International Decisions</b>		
<i>Edited by David P. Stewart</i>		
<i>Territorial and Maritime Dispute (Nicaragua v. Colombia)</i> (Nienke Grossman)		396
<p>International Court of Justice judgment on disputed islands and maritime boundaries</p>		
<i>The "ARA Libertad" (Argentina v. Ghana)</i> (James Kraska)		404
<p>International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea provisional measures order regarding detention of Argentine naval training vessel</p>		
<i>Pringle v. Ireland</i> (Christoph W. Herrmann)		410
<p>European Court of Justice judgment on validity of stability mechanism for euro area member states</p>		
<i>Hirsi Jamaa v. Italy</i> (Irina Papanicolopulu)		417
<p>European Court of Human Rights judgment on Italy's interdiction of migrants from Libya on the high seas</p>		

<i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> (Triestino Mariniello)	424
Special Tribunal for Sierra Leone judgments on head-of-state immunity for war crimes and crimes against humanity and on sentencing guidelines	

## Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International Law

*Edited by John R. Crook*

Supreme Court Grants Certiorari in Case Implicating <i>Missouri v. Holland</i>	432
Presidential Signing Statement Disputes Provisions of National Defense Authorization Act	434
United States Recognizes Government of Somalia After Two-Decade Hiatus	436
United States Promotes Informal Multilateral Counterterrorism Mechanism	437
New U.S.-Mexican Agreement on Allocation of Colorado River Water	439
United States Supports New Multilateral Convention to Limit Mercury Discharges	442
United States Rejects International Telecommunications Union Conference Outcome, Fearing Interference with Internet Freedom	444
U.S. Efforts to Enhance Cybersecurity and to Counter International Theft of Trade Secrets	447
Jackson-Vanik Amendment Repealed; Magnitsky Provisions Draw Russian Ire and Termination of Adoption and Anticrime Agreements	449
U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission Adopts "Conflict Minerals" Rule	452
U.S. Department of State Legal Adviser's Views on International Criminal Justice	454
Bolivia Rejoins Narcotics Convention with Reservation Protecting Coca Leaf over U.S. and Others' Objections	460
U.S. Department of Justice "White Paper" Addresses Legal Basis for Use of Lethal Force Against U.S. Citizens	462
United States Provides Military Support to French Operations Against Militants in Mali	466
United States Supports New Security Council Sanctions Following North Korean Missile Launch; North Korea Responds with Third Nuclear Test	469
U.S. Supreme Court Rules in Hague Child Abduction Case, Urges Speed by Lower Courts in Such Cases	471
Brief Notes	474

## Recent Books on International Law

*Edited by Richard B. Bilder*

### Book Reviews

Cassese, Antonio (ed.). <i>Realizing Utopia: The Future of International Law</i> (John Dugard)	478
Krisch, Nico. <i>Beyond Constitutionalism: The Pluralist Structure of Postnational Law</i> (Jeffrey L. Dunoff)	483
Berman, Paul Schiff. <i>Global Legal Pluralism: A Jurisprudence of Law Beyond Borders</i> (Peter J. Spiro)	488
Ryan, Allan A. <i>Yamashita's Ghost: War Crimes, MacArthur's Justice, and Command Accountability</i> (Detlev F. Vagts)	491
Pahuja, Sundhya. <i>Decolonising International Law: Development, Economic Growth and the Politics of Universality</i> (James Thuo Gathii)	494
Marauhn, Thilo, and Heinhard Steiger (eds.). <i>Universality and Continuity in International Law</i> (Stephen C. Neff)	500
Möller, Jakob Th., and Alfred de Zayas. <i>United Nations Human Rights Committee Case Law 1977–2008</i> ; Tyagi, Yogesh. <i>The UN Human Rights Committee: Practice and Procedure</i> (Suzannah Phillips)	504

### Briefer Notice

Wolfrum, Rüdiger (ed.). <i>The Max Planck Encyclopedia of Public International Law</i> (Sean D. Murphy)	510
---	-----

### Books Received

<b>International Legal Materials. Contents, Vol. LI, No. 6</b>	515
--	-----



# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

VOL. 107

July 2013

NO. 3

CONTENTS

PAGE

<b>Congress Underestimated: The Case of the World Bank</b>	<i>Kristina Daugirdas</i>	517
<p>This article challenges the oft-repeated claim that international organizations undermine democracy by marginalizing national legislatures. Over the past forty years, Congress has established itself as a key player in setting U.S. policy toward the World Bank. Congress has done far more than restrain executive branch action with which it disagrees; it has affirmatively shaped the United States' day-to-day participation in this key international organization and successfully defended its constitutional authority to do so.</p>		
<b>Notes and Comments</b>		
Self-Defense Against Nonstate Actors (Continuation of the Debate)		
Clarifying Necessity, Imminence, and Proportionality in the Law of Self-Defense	<i>Dapo Akande and Thomas Liefländer</i>	563
The Nonconsenting Innocent State: The Problem with Bethlehem's Principle 12	<i>Dire Tladi</i>	570
Are New Principles Really Needed? The Potential of the Established Distinction Between Responsibility for Attacks by Nonstate Actors and the Law of Self-Defense	<i>Mahmoud Hmoud</i>	576
Principles of Self-Defense—A Brief Response	<i>Daniel Bethlehem</i>	579
The Francis Deák Prize		585
Nominations for the Board of Editors		586
Transition of the Editors in Chief		586
<b>Current Developments</b>		
The 2012 Judicial Activity of the International Court of Justice	<i>Jacob Katz Cogan</i>	587
<b>International Decisions</b> <i>Edited by David P. Stewart</i>		
<b>Featured Decision: <i>Kiobel v. Royal Dutch Petroleum Co.</i>: The Supreme Court and the Alien Tort Statute (Ingrid Wuerth)</b>		601
U.S. Supreme Court decision on application of the presumption against extra-territoriality to the Alien Tort Statute		
<i>Prosecutor v. Perišić</i> (Christopher Jenks)		622
International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia appeals judgment on aiding and abetting liability for war crimes and on command responsibility		
<i>Korean Film Export &amp; Import Corp. v. Fuji Television Network</i> (Mizushima Tomonori)		627
Supreme Court of Japan decision on effect of unrecognized state's accession to a multilateral treaty		
<i>Criminal Proceedings Against Albers</i> (Filippo Fontanelli)		632
Italian Court of Cassation decision applying ICJ judgment on Germany's sovereign immunity from civil claims for war crimes		

<i>NML Capital Ltd. v. Republic of Argentina</i> (Alexander Blumrosen and Fleur Malet-Deraedt)	638
French Court of Cassation judgment on Argentina's immunity from provisional attachment of funds	
<i>United States v. Dire</i> (Eugene Kontorovich)	644
U.S. court of appeals decision on definition of piracy under international law	

### **Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International Law**

*Edited by John R. Crook*

U.S. Supreme Court Unanimously Rejects Alien Tort Statute Jurisdiction in <i>Kiobel</i>	651
United States Recognizes Syrian Opposition as "Legitimate Representative of the Syrian People," Will Provide Small Arms and Ammunition to Opposition Forces	654
Eleventh Circuit Affirms Injunction Against Florida's Cuba Sanctions Law, Finds Federal Preemption	659
Arctic Council Meets; United States and Other Arctic States Conclude Marine Oil Pollution Agreement	661
Ninth Circuit Rules Antiwhaling Group Engaged in Piracy	666
Mounting U.S. Government Concern over Attacks on Private and Government Computer Networks Originating in China	669
U.S. Agencies Revise U.S. Export Controls on Major Aerospace Exports	671
U.S. Department of State Issues Detroit-Windsor Bridge Permit, Continues Deliberations on Keystone XL Pipeline	673
President Obama Outlines Shifts in U.S. Counterterrorism Policy	674
U.S. Attorney General Confirms Deaths of Four Americans in U.S. Counterterrorism Operations	679
U.S. Department of Defense Directive on Autonomous Weapons Systems	681
Guatemala and United States CAFTA-DR Labor Standards Arbitration Suspended	684
Brief Notes	686

### **Recent Books on International Law**

*Edited by Richard B. Bilder*

#### **Book Reviews**

Cohen, Jean L. <i>Globalization and Sovereignty: Rethinking Legality, Legitimacy, and Constitutionalism</i> (José E. Alvarez)	697
Giorgetti, Chiara. <i>The Rules, Practice, and Jurisprudence of International Courts and Tribunals</i> (Ronald Bettauer)	703
Butler, William E., and Vladimir G. Tunkin (eds.). <i>The Tunkin Diary and Lectures: The Diary and Collected Lectures of G. I. Tunkin at the Hague Academy of International Law</i> (Rein Müllerson)	710
Goldsmith, Jack. <i>Power and Constraint: The Accountable Presidency After 9/11</i> (Daniel Bodansky)	714
MacKinnon, Catharine A. <i>Are Women Human? And Other International Dialogues</i> (Hilary Charlesworth)	719
Drumbl, Mark A. <i>Reimagining Child Soldiers in International Law and Policy</i> (Diane Marie Amann)	724
Eboe-Osuji, Chile. <i>International Law and Sexual Violence in Armed Conflicts</i> (Jide Nzelibe)	728

#### **Books Received**

731

**International Legal Materials.** Contents, Vol. LII, Nos. 1, 2

734



# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

VOL. 107

October 2013

NO. 4

CONTENTS

PAGE

## A New International Human Rights Court for West Africa: The ECOWAS Community Court of Justice

*Karen J. Alter, Laurence R. Helfer, and Jacqueline R. McAllister* 737

The Court of Justice for the Economic Community of West African States has been transformed from an interstate tribunal for resolving disputes over ECOWAS economic rules into a court with far-reaching human rights jurisdiction. This article identifies political mobilization, rather than judicial lawmaking, as the catalyst of this transformation, and explains the surprising reality that, whereas private actors in recent years have been able to pursue legal actions alleging human rights violations, they remain unable to challenge state noncompliance with ECOWAS economic rules.

## The *Travaux* of *Travaux*: Is the Vienna Convention Hostile to Drafting History?

*Julian Davis Mortenson* 780

It is often said that the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties relegated drafting history to a subsidiary role in treaty interpretation. This article relies on a close reading of the Convention's own drafting history to challenge that view. Under the settlement actually negotiated by the drafters, reference to *travaux préparatoires* was meant to be a regular, central, and indeed indispensable component of the interpretive process.

## In Memoriam

Detlev F. Vagts (1929–2013) *Peter D. Trooboff* 823

## Agora: Reflections on *Kiobel*

Unshackling Foreign Corporations: *Kiobel*'s Unexpected Legacy *Anupam Chander* 829

*Kiobel* and the Surprising Death of Universal Jurisdiction Under the Alien Tort Statute *Julian G. Ku* 835

*Kiobel* and the Weakening of Precedent: A Long Walk for a Short Drink *Ralph G. Steinhardt* 841

Waving Not Drowning: *Kiobel* Outside the United States *Robert McCorquodale* 846

The Paradox of *Kiobel* in Europe *Caroline Kaeb and David Scheffer* 852

Reviving Human Rights Litigation After *Kiobel* *Vivian Grosswald Curran and David Sloss* 858

## International Decisions

**Featured Decision:** First WTO Judicial Review of Climate Change Subsidy Issues (*Canada—Certain Measures Affecting the Renewable Energy Generation Sector; Canada—Measures Relating to the Feed-in Tariff Program*) (Sherzod Shadikhodjaev) 864

World Trade Organization Appellate Body decision on validity of Canada's feed-in tariff program under the subsidies regime *Commission v. Kadi* (Clemens A. Feinäugle) 878

European Court of Justice judgment on legality of Commission regulation implementing UN Security Council counterterrorism sanctions



<i>Stichting Mothers of Srebrenica v. Netherlands</i> (Jacob Katz Cogan)	884
European Court of Human Rights decision on UN immunity from claims regarding victims of the 1995 Srebrenica massacre	
<i>TBB—Turkish Union in Berlin/Brandenburg v. Germany</i> (Amy Senier)	891
Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination opinion on obligations of Germany to protect its Turkish and Arab populations from discriminatory speech	
<b>Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International Law</b>	
	<i>Edited by John R. Crook</i>
United States Threatens Military Strikes Against Syria, Then Joins in Diplomatic Efforts to Control Syrian Chemical Weapons	900
D.C. Circuit Rules Statute Authorizing “Israel” as Place of Birth on Passports of Citizens Born in Jerusalem Is Unconstitutional	907
Florida Highway Patrol Will Observe Road Traffic Treaty and Not Enforce Conflicting State Statute	910
Solicitor General’s Brief in <i>Bond v. United States</i> Defends <i>Missouri v. Holland</i>	912
Second Circuit Rejects Argentina’s Immunity Claim in Action to Confirm ICSID Award	914
New York Supreme Court Addresses Immunity of Heads of International Organizations	916
U.S. Clothing Retailers Adopt Factory Safety Plan for Bangladesh	918
U.S. Executive Order Addresses International Trafficking in Wildlife	924
United States Endorses Results of UN Negotiations on Transparency and Confidence Building in Outer Space	926
United States—New Zealand Proposal for Marine Protected Area in Ross Sea Fails to Win Required Unanimous Approval	928
Second Circuit Affirms Orders Requiring Argentina to Treat Restructured and Holdout Bondholders Equally; Argentina Seeks Certiorari in Related Extraterritorial Discovery Case	930
United States Supports New Treaty to Facilitate Visually Impaired Persons’ Access to Books	933
Ecuador “Suspends Support” for U.S. Andean Trade Promotion and Drug Eradication Act	935
U.S. Government Responds to Poor Working Conditions in Bangladesh’s Garment Industry	936
U.S. Court Sentences New Hampshire Resident for Lying About Her Participation in Rwandan Genocide to Secure U.S. Entry and Citizenship	939
U.S. Court Sentences Somali Pirates to Life Imprisonment for Murder of Four Americans	940
U.S. Department of Justice Pursues International Cybercriminals	941
White House Document Outlines Standards and Procedures for U.S. Use of Force in Counterterrorism Operations	943
U.S. Supreme Court to Review D.C. Circuit Decision Vacating Bilateral Investment Treaty Award Against Argentina	946
Brief Notes	947
<b>Recent Books on International Law</b>	<i>Edited by Richard B. Bilder</i>
<b>Book Reviews</b>	
O’Connell, Mary Ellen (ed.). <i>What Is War? An Investigation in the Wake of 9/11</i> ;	
Wilmshurst, Elizabeth (ed.). <i>International Law and the Classification of Conflicts</i> (Laurie R. Blank)	952
Clapham, Andrew. <i>Brierly’s Law of Nations: An Introduction to the Role of International Law in International Relations</i> (7th ed.); Crawford, James. <i>Brownlie’s Principles of Public International Law</i> (8th ed.) (Omri Sender and Michael Wood)	959
Waldron, Jeremy. “Partly Laws Common to All Mankind”: <i>Foreign Law in American Courts</i> (Aaron Xavier Fellmeth)	963
Whitman, James Q. <i>The Verdict of Battle: The Law of Victory and the Making of Modern War</i> (Robert D. Sloane)	972
Parra, Antonio R. <i>The History of ICSID</i> (Monique Sasson)	980
Shinohara, Hatsue. <i>U.S. International Lawyers in the Interwar Years: A Forgotten Crusade</i> (Mark Weston Janis)	984
<b>Books Received</b>	985
<b>International Legal Materials.</b> Contents, Vol. LII, Nos. 3, 4	990
<b>Table of Cases</b>	992
<b>Index</b>	997